

TOWARDS ADEQUATE ANALYSIS AND MODELING  
OF STRUCTURAL ADJUSTMENT PROGRAMS:  
AN ANALYTICAL FRAMEWORK WITH APPLICATION  
TO GHANA

Egor Kraev

School of Public Policy  
University of Maryland, College Park

October 10, 2004

# Abstract

When a country experiences a balance of payments problem, the typical remedy mix proposed by the International Monetary Fund consists of fiscal austerity, tight monetary policies, devaluation, privatization, elimination of subsidies and trade liberalization, combined with low interest rate loans. Throughout the late 1980s, Ghana has been hailed as a success story for that policy mix. However, Ghana's performance has been increasingly disappointing during the 1990s. This thesis explores the reasons for that slowdown, its distributional implications, and the extent to which the behavior of the Ghanaian economy validates commonly used assumptions in economic models of developing countries.

We compile a complete consistent yearly dataset of financial stocks, nominal money flows (arranged in Social Accounting Matrices) and real product flows for Ghana in 1990-2001. The real-side data, available yearly, are then examined using fit optimization with alternative functional forms, while nominal time series (Consumer Price Index, the broad money supply and the exchange rate), available on a monthly basis, are analyzed using ARIMA-X regressions.

We find that industrial production, as well as investment, has been demand-constrained during our period, while agriculture has hit an aggregate supply constraint around year 1995. The relative price elasticity of substitution between imports and non-traded goods (in volume terms) is around minus one. The government was the only net source of demand during the period. Inflation could be predicted extremely well using only broad money supply, wholesale price of food crops and price of fuel, and formed a weak positive feedback loop with money supply growth. The main channel through which exchange rate depreciation impacted the price level was revaluation of the foreign currency-denominated money supply component. The response of broad money supply to interest rate increases was significant but small. We also formulate a novel matrix formalism for a more compact description and analysis of financial stock dynamics, cleanly separating structural and accounting constraints from behavioral descriptions.

We conclude that the major reasons for the economic slowdown of the 1990s were excessive liberalization of commodity imports and strangulation of industry through lack of demand and volatile real interest rates, and of agriculture through withdrawal of government support programs.

# Contents

|          |   |           |
|----------|---|-----------|
| <b>1</b> | <b>Introduction</b>   | <b>10</b> |
| 1.1      | Research Questions . . . . .  | 10        |
| 1.1.1    | Why Was Macroeconomic Performance Not Sustained? . . . . .  | 10        |
| 1.1.2    | What Were the Distributive Impacts? . . . . .   | 10        |
| 1.1.3    | Does the behavior of the Ghanaian Economy in 1990s conform to the assumptions of economic models? . . . . . | 11        |
| 1.2      | Methods and Intermediate Results . . . . .  | 11        |
| 1.2.1    | Compile a Dataset: SAM/FAM time series for 1990-2001 . . . . .  | 11        |
| 1.2.2    | Statistical Analysis of Selected Variables . . . . .  | 12        |
| 1.2.3    | Discussion of Quantitative Results' Implications . . . . .  | 14        |
| 1.3      | Results . . . . .   | 14        |
| 1.3.1    | Neoclassical/Monetarist vs. Structuralist Theory . . . . .  | 14        |
| 1.3.2    | Reasons for Poor Macroeconomic Performance . . . . .  | 15        |
| 1.3.3    | Distributional Impacts . . . . .  | 15        |
| 1.4      | Limitations . . . . .   | 16        |
| 1.4.1    | No Formal Overall Model . . . . .   | 16        |
| 1.4.2    | Limited Analysis of Distributional Impacts . . . . .  | 17        |
| 1.5      | Structure of This Manuscript . . . . .  | 18        |
| <b>2</b> | <b>Structural Adjustment</b>  | <b>19</b> |
| 2.1      | What is Structural Adjustment? . . . . .  | 19        |
| 2.2      | A Typical Structural Adjustment Policy Package . . . . .  | 19        |
| 2.3      | Assessments and Criticisms . . . . .  | 21        |
| <b>3</b> | <b>Structural Adjustment in Ghana</b>   | <b>23</b> |
| 3.1      | The economies of Sub-Saharan Africa . . . . .   | 23        |
| 3.2      | The case of Ghana . . . . .   | 24        |
| 3.2.1    | Fiscal Policy . . . . .   | 27        |
| 3.2.2    | Monetary Policy . . . . .   | 29        |
| 3.2.3    | Inflation . . . . .   | 31        |
| 3.2.4    | Labor Market . . . . .  | 32        |
| 3.2.5    | Sectoral Behavior . . . . .   | 33        |
| 3.2.6    | External Trade and Balance of Payments . . . . .  | 35        |
| 3.3      | Summary . . . . .   | 37        |

|          |   |           |
|----------|---|-----------|
| <b>4</b> | <b>Currently Used Methodologies</b>   | <b>38</b> |
| 4.1      | Fixed Ratio Models . . . . .  | 39        |
| 4.1.1    | Key assumptions . . . . .   | 39        |
| 4.1.2    | Strengths . . . . .   | 39        |
| 4.1.3    | Main weakness . . . . .   | 40        |
| 4.2      | Statistical Macro Models . . . . .  | 40        |
| 4.2.1    | Main assumptions . . . . .  | 40        |
| 4.2.2    | Strength . . . . .  | 41        |
| 4.2.3    | Weaknesses . . . . .  | 41        |
| 4.3      | Computable General Equilibrium Models . . . . .   | 41        |
| 4.3.1    | Key assumptions . . . . .   | 41        |
| 4.3.2    | Strengths . . . . .   | 42        |
| 4.3.3    | Weaknesses . . . . .  | 42        |
| 4.4      | The Major Differences between Neoclassical and Structuralist CGE Models . . . . .                 | 43        |
| 4.4.1    | Neoclassical CGE Models . . . . .   | 43        |
| 4.4.2    | Structuralist CGE Models . . . . .  | 45        |
| 4.4.3    | Whose assumptions are better? . . . . .   | 45        |
| 4.5      | Microsimulation Models . . . . .  | 47        |
| 4.6      | Summary . . . . .   | 48        |
| <b>5</b> | <b>An Introduction to Useful Accounting Concepts</b>  | <b>49</b> |
| 5.1      | Social Accounting Matrix . . . . .  | 49        |
| 5.2      | Real Product Flows . . . . .  | 52        |
| 5.3      | Financial Accounting Matrix . . . . .   | 53        |
| 5.3.1    | Monetary Aggregates and Control of Money Supply . . . . .   | 56        |
| 5.4      | Summary . . . . .   | 58        |
| <b>6</b> | <b>The Approach of This Thesis</b>  | <b>59</b> |
| 6.1      | Introduction . . . . .  | 59        |
| 6.2      | Stock-Flow Consistent Accounting, Social Accounting Matrices and SAM/FAM<br>Time Series . . . . . | 60        |
| 6.3      | Examination of the Behavior of Key Variables . . . . .  | 60        |
| 6.4      | Methodological Contributions Towards a Model . . . . .  | 61        |
| 6.5      | In-depth Discussion of Implications for Theory and Policy . . . . .                               | 61        |
| 6.6      | Discussion . . . . .  | 62        |
| 6.7      | Summary . . . . .   | 63        |
| <b>7</b> | <b>Compilation of a SAM/FAM Time Series 1990-2001</b>   | <b>64</b> |
| 7.1      | Data Sources . . . . .  | 64        |
| 7.2      | Sectoral Structure . . . . .  | 70        |
| 7.3      | Overall Accounting Framework . . . . .  | 75        |
| 7.4      | Structure of the Social Accounting Matrix . . . . .   | 75        |
| 7.5      | Financial Accounting Matrix . . . . .   | 83        |
| 7.5.1    | FAM Time Series Compilation . . . . .   | 83        |
| 7.5.2    | Net lending flows implied by the FAM . . . . .  | 85        |
| 7.6      | Reconciliation . . . . .  | 85        |
| 7.7      | Discussion . . . . .  | 86        |

|           |   |            |
|-----------|---|------------|
| 7.7.1     | Are Different Levels of Household Aggregation in Different Parts of the Framework Defensible? . . . . . | 86         |
| 7.8       | Summary . . . . .   | 87         |
| <b>8</b>  | <b>Decomposing the FAM dynamics</b>   | <b>90</b>  |
| 8.1       | Revaluation . . . . .   | 90         |
| 8.2       | Current Transactions . . . . .  | 91         |
| 8.3       | Capital Transactions . . . . .  | 91         |
| 8.4       | The Master Equation for FAM Dynamics . . . . .  | 93         |
| 8.5       | Reconstructing Transaction Flows From FAM Time Series . . . . .   | 93         |
| 8.6       | The Transaction Matrices We Use . . . . .   | 96         |
| 8.7       | Summary . . . . .   | 96         |
| <b>9</b>  | <b>Investigation of key individual time series</b>  | <b>98</b>  |
| 9.1       | A method for dealing with short data series . . . . .   | 98         |
| 9.2       | Supply Side . . . . .   | 100        |
| 9.2.1     | Incremental Capital-Output Ratio . . . . .  | 100        |
| 9.2.2     | Real Investment . . . . .   | 100        |
| 9.2.3     | Ratio of exports to nontraded goods in industrial production . . . . .                                  | 102        |
| 9.2.4     | Ratio of exports to nontraded goods in agricultural production . . . . .                                | 103        |
| 9.2.5     | Behavior of the Agricultural Sector . . . . .   | 105        |
| 9.3       | Demand Side . . . . .   | 107        |
| 9.3.1     | Demand Injection Decomposition . . . . .  | 107        |
| 9.3.2     | Net Private Savings . . . . .   | 107        |
| 9.3.3     | Consumption Function . . . . .  | 110        |
| 9.3.4     | Ratio of imports to nontraded goods consumption . . . . .   | 110        |
| <b>10</b> | <b>Fix-flex Accounting in an Open Economy</b>   | <b>114</b> |
| 10.1      | A Fix-Flex Framework in an Open Economy . . . . .   | 114        |
| 10.2      | Summary . . . . .   | 117        |
| <b>11</b> | <b>Econometric Investigation of Monthly Time Series</b>   | <b>118</b> |
| 11.1      | Introduction . . . . .  | 118        |
| 11.2      | Consumer Price Index . . . . .  | 119        |
| 11.2.1    | Summary . . . . .   | 126        |
| 11.3      | Money Supply . . . . .  | 126        |
| 11.3.1    | Summary . . . . .   | 133        |
| 11.4      | Price Level - Money Supply Feedback Loop . . . . .  | 133        |
| 11.5      | Exchange Rate . . . . .   | 135        |
| 11.5.1    | Summary . . . . .   | 139        |
| <b>12</b> | <b>Discussion I: Implications for Theory</b>  | <b>141</b> |
| 12.1      | Methodological Innovations . . . . .  | 141        |
| 12.1.1    | Dataset Compilation . . . . .   | 141        |
| 12.1.2    | Systematic Integration of Financial Stock Time Series with Flow Data . . . . .                          | 142        |
| 12.1.3    | Testing Nonlinear Relationships on Short Data Series . . . . .  | 142        |
| 12.1.4    | A Simple Core for a Dynamic Fix-Flex Model . . . . .  | 142        |

|           |  |            |
|-----------|--|------------|
| 12.1.5    | A Compact Formalism for Description and Analysis of Financial Stock Dynamics . . . . .           | 143        |
| 12.2      | Structure of the Ghanaian Economy Compared to Common Model Assumptions . .                       | 143        |
| 12.2.1    | Structuralist vs. Monetarist views on Price Formation . . . . .                                  | 143        |
| 12.2.2    | Output Determination and the Balance of Payments . . . . .                                       | 146        |
| 12.2.3    | Exchange Rate Determination . . . . .  | 148        |
| 12.2.4    | Is building CGE models worthwhile? . . . . .   | 149        |
| 12.3      | Summary . . . . .  | 150        |
| <b>13</b> | <b>Discussion II: Implications for Policy</b>  | <b>152</b> |
| 13.1      | What were the likely consequences of Structural Adjustment Policies in Ghana? . .                | 152        |
| 13.2      | Answering Our Research Questions . . . . .   | 157        |
| 13.2.1    | Why Was Macroeconomic Performance Not Sustained? . . . . .                                       | 157        |
| 13.2.2    | What Were the Distributive Impacts of the Structural Adjustment Policies in the 1990s? . . . . . | 159        |
| 13.3      | Policy Suggestions . . . . .   | 159        |
| 13.3.1    | Trade Policy . . . . .   | 160        |
| 13.3.2    | Sectoral Policies . . . . .  | 160        |
| 13.3.3    | Fiscal Policy . . . . .  | 161        |
| 13.3.4    | Exchange Rate Policy . . . . .   | 161        |
| 13.3.5    | Monetary Policy . . . . .  | 162        |
| 13.4      | Summary . . . . .  | 162        |
| <b>14</b> | <b>Conclusion</b>  | <b>164</b> |
| <b>A</b>  | <b>The structure of the SAM</b>  | <b>167</b> |
| <b>B</b>  | <b>Decomposition with Respect to a Basis Using a Scalar Product</b>                              | <b>169</b> |

# List of Tables

|      |  |     |
|------|--|-----|
| 3.1  | <i>Indicators of Ghana’s adherence to Structural Adjustment policies.</i>                              | 28  |
| 5.1  | <i>A Simple Social Accounting Matrix</i>   | 50  |
| 5.2  | <i>Structure of the Financial Accounting Matrix</i>  | 55  |
| 5.3  | <i>Central Bank Balance Sheet</i>  | 57  |
| 5.4  | <i>Banking System Balance Sheet</i>  | 57  |
| 7.1  | <i>Data Sources. The italicized sources have not been used in compiling our dataset.</i>               | 67  |
| 7.2  | <i>The Sectoral Disaggregation of Ghana National Accounts</i>  | 71  |
| 7.3  | <i>The Sectoral Grouping Used in This Thesis</i>   | 72  |
| 7.4  | <i>Imports/Exports By Sector</i>   | 74  |
| 7.5  | <i>The real production flows</i>   | 77  |
| 7.6  | <i>The Leontief Matrix</i>   | 78  |
| 7.7  | <i>Overall Social Accounting Matrix Structure</i>  | 79  |
| 7.8  | <i>Factor Shares in Value Added</i>  | 81  |
| 7.9  | <i>Structure of the Financial Accounting Matrix</i>  | 82  |
| 8.1  | <i>The transaction matrix for creation of new local-currency denominated loans</i>                     | 92  |
| 8.2  | <i>Transaction Matrices Used in this Thesis</i>  | 97  |
| 9.1  | <i>Ratio of investment to GDP as function of relative price of imports and of interest rates</i>       | 101 |
| 9.2  | <i>Ratio of exports to nontraded goods in industrial production as function of relative price</i>      | 103 |
| 9.3  | <i>Ratio of exports to nontraded goods in agricultural production as function of relative price</i>    | 104 |
| 9.4  | <i>Private consumption plus investment as share of private disposable income</i>                       | 109 |
| 9.5  | <i>Consumption of industrial goods as function of total consumption and relative price</i>             | 110 |
| 9.6  | <i>Ratio of imports to nontraded goods in consumed industrial goods as function of relative price</i>  | 111 |
| 9.7  | <i>Ratio of imports to nontraded in consumed non-government services as function of relative price</i> | 112 |
| 11.1 | <i>Preliminary Lag Structure Examination for CPI</i>   | 121 |
| 11.2 | <i>ARIMA-X model identification for <math>D.cpi</math></i>   | 122 |
| 11.3 | <i>ARIMA-X regression for <math>D.cpi</math></i>   | 123 |
| 11.4 | <i>Summary of ARIMA-X regression for <math>D.cpi</math></i>  | 124 |
| 11.5 | <i>ARIMA-X model identification for <math>D.m2</math></i>  | 128 |

|       |  |     |
|-------|--|-----|
| 11.6  | <i>ARIMA-X regression for D.m2</i>                                 | 129 |
| 11.7  | <i>Summary of ARIMA-X regression for D.m2</i>                      | 129 |
| 11.8  | <i>ARIMA-X model identification for D.m2, no constant</i>          | 131 |
| 11.9  | <i>ARIMA-X regression for D.m2, no constant</i>                    | 131 |
| 11.10 | <i>Summary of ARIMA-X regression for D.m2, no constant</i>         | 132 |
| 11.11 | <i>Preliminary Lag Structure Examination for the Exchange Rate</i> | 135 |
| 11.12 | <i>ARIMA-X model identification for D.er</i>                       | 136 |
| 11.13 | <i>ARIMA-X regression for D.er</i>                                 | 136 |
| 11.14 | <i>Summary of ARIMA-X regression for D.er</i>                      | 137 |
| A.1   | <i>The Blocks of the Social Accounting Matrix</i>                  | 168 |



# List of Figures

|      |   |     |
|------|---|-----|
| 3.1  | <i>Population Growth, Annual (World Development Indicators 2002)</i> . . . . .  | 25  |
| 3.2  | <i>GDP growth, Annual (World Development Indicators 2002)</i> . . . . .   | 26  |
| 3.3  | <i>GDP Deflator, Annual Inflation (World Development Indicators 2002)</i> . . . . .   | 27  |
| 3.4  | <i>Debt to GDP ratio (World Development Indicators 2002)</i> . . . . .  | 27  |
| 3.5  | <i>Composition of the Fiscal Deficit (International Monetary Fund)</i> . . . . .  | 28  |
| 3.6  | <i>Monetary Policy Indicators</i> . . . . .   | 30  |
| 3.7  | <i>Employment composition (GLSS1-4 and author's estimates)</i> . . . . .  | 32  |
| 3.8  | <i>Average Households' Income Composition in 1993 by Main Occupation (author's estimates from GLSS4 data)</i> . . . . .         | 33  |
| 3.9  | <i>Effective Tariff Rates on Trade (World Development Indicators 2002, Oduro [2000], International Monetary Fund)</i> . . . . . | 35  |
| 3.10 | <i>GDP, imports, and exports in real terms (author's estimates, Chapter 7)</i> . . . . .  | 36  |
| 3.11 | <i>Some Price Indices (IMF Ghana Desk Country Reports and author's estimates)</i> . . . . .                                     | 37  |
| 5.1  | <i>A simple money flow diagram</i> . . . . .  | 50  |
| 5.2  | <i>A more realistic SAM</i> . . . . .   | 51  |
| 5.3  | <i>Real Product Flows</i> . . . . .   | 52  |
| 7.1  | <i>Shares of Subsectors in Value Added</i> . . . . .  | 68  |
| 7.2  | <i>Manufacturing output discrepancy</i> . . . . .   | 68  |
| 7.3  | <i>Sectoral Deflators (Source: World Development Indicators 2002; International Monetary Fund)</i> . . . . .                    | 69  |
| 7.4  | <i>Investment to GDP ratios computed from nominal resp. real time series (source: International Monetary Fund)</i> . . . . .    | 70  |
| 7.5  | <i>Our Overall Accounting Framework as a Flow Chart</i> . . . . .   | 76  |
| 7.6  | <i>Share of foreign-denominated loans and deposits in the respective total</i> . . . . .  | 84  |
| 7.7  | <i>Relative Adjustments During FAM/SAM Reconciliation</i> . . . . .   | 87  |
| 7.8  | <i>Total Multiplier Effect as Function of Total On-Impact Household Income</i> . . . . .  | 88  |
| 7.9  | <i>The Patterns of Multiplier Income For Different Injections</i> . . . . .   | 88  |
| 9.1  | <i>Ratio of Investment to GDP (log scale)</i> . . . . .   | 102 |
| 9.2  | <i>Food crop production, wholesale price of food crops relative to the CPI and land area under cultivation</i> . . . . .        | 105 |
| 9.3  | <i>Net Lending By Institution</i> . . . . .   | 108 |
| 9.4  | <i>Taylor Decomposition of Demand Injections</i> . . . . .  | 108 |
| 11.1 | <i>Inflation and Money Supply Growth</i> . . . . .  | 120 |
| 11.2 | <i>Contributions to Inflation Derived from Table 11.3</i> . . . . .   | 125 |

|       |  |     |
|-------|--|-----|
| 11.3  | <i>Actual CPI vs. predictions from ARIMA-X regressions</i>                                   | 126 |
| 11.4  | <i>Actual M2 vs. predictions from ARIMA-X regressions</i>                                    | 130 |
| 11.5  | <i>Actual M2 vs. predictions from ARIMA-X regressions without a constant term</i>            | 132 |
| 11.6  | <i>Impact of a unit increase in m2 on cpi</i>  | 134 |
| 11.7  | <i>Impact of a unit increase in cpi on m2</i>  | 134 |
| 11.8  | <i>Actual exchange rate vs. predictions from ARIMA-X regressions</i>                         | 137 |
| 11.9  | <i>Actual exchange rate vs. predictions from ARIMA-X regressions without a constant term</i> | 138 |
| 11.10 | <i>Inflation vs. Depreciation for Falling vs. Floating Periods</i>                           | 139 |
| 11.11 | <i>Exchange Rate Depreciation, Falling/Floating Periods, and Foreign Exchange Reserves</i>   | 140 |